

## Local-Face and Mixed-Race in *Femina* Magazine and *Nova* Tabloid: Hybridity and Mimicry in Beauty and Daily Products in Indonesia's Advertisements

Tantri Puspita Yazid<sup>1</sup> & Yayuk Lestari<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Lecturer of Social and Political Science Faculty, Riau University

### ABSTRACT

This article compares ads of beauty products featured by mixed-race models and ads of daily products (daily consumption) featured by local-look models in Indonesian women's magazines. By using semiotic approach, in this context I have tried to identify hybridity and mimicry in *Royco*, *Mama Lemon*, *Scotch Brite*, *Lux*, *Marie-France* and *Pond's* ads and then related the findings to whiteness and consumption. There seems to be uniformity in perceiving beauty by making Western woman as the reference, and the mixed-race that physically resembles much more closely the appearance of Western woman can therefore be dominant in beauty products ads. Mimicry and hybridity that I find in most ads is presented in different ways. Daily products tend to use metaphors to represent hybridity whereas beauty products employ mixed-raced models as the element of hybrid. However, the ambivalence inherent in hybrid enables mixed-race to imitate and to be imitated at the same time. In this context, the hybrid imitates a Western woman as the original and then the hybrid is imitated by the local face to become a hybrid. The difference of treatment of daily and beauty products can be seen in the women's role and how they consume the products in both types of ads. While it is evident that ads of daily product fortify the position of local women in domestic affairs, the mixed-race women as the imitation of Western women are stereotyped as women of freedom and beauty. This strengthens the connotation of Western lifestyle that tends to live in glamour, leisure, and wealth.

**Keywords:** Hybridity; Mimicry; Mixed-race; Local-look; Whiteness; Consumption

### INTRODUCTION

My interest in beauty construction grew since I was just a teenager; I grew up in small town in Indonesia. The obsession about becoming white was controlling my life. I wanted to look like what I saw in the media. I realized when I watched television, read magazines and newspaper, I felt my non-existence there. I was alienated in my own culture; I could not find any actresses, models or singers representing my skin and face. At this point, I started questioning whether I was the outsider due to my being different. In order to look like them, I had to save money to purchase a whitening product. It took years to realize that it was not I who got darker but it was they who were getting whiter. Most of the models are of mixed-race (half-Indonesian and half non-Indonesian, usually Western, Chinese or Indian).

Taking my teenage experience as a point of departure, in this article I will attempt to expand not only on the issue of whiteness but also on the body appearance closely associated with the image of western people. For that reason, in  
g products as well as

soap and categorized them as beauty products. I have come to decide on those products since the construction of beauty does not merely refer to skin but also to body and physical appearance. While beauty products have become valuable and desirable, less attention by scholars has been given to non-beauty products, therefore in this article I will try to compare between beauty and ordinary products. Since the models of the latter products are daily people (local people), typically dark-skinned and casually dressed, they appear as being "WE", part of us. They are not idealized as meeting the standard of true beauty except that they are idealized to be housewives (us).

In this article it has not been my intention to argue about the classification of beauty and ordinary products. Instead, I will look at beauty products simply as products designed to beautify (e.g. soap and whitening products) and ordinary products as products used for household needs (e.g. liquid soap and detergent). In the analysis part I will elaborate the different treatment applied to both types of products.

#### HYBRIDITY AND MIMICRY IN INDONESIA ADVERTISEMENTS

In order to explain how the domination of mixed-race works and then relate it to how we consume and perceived the mimicry and hybridity laid in selected advertisements (beauty and daily products) I will use Bhabha's mimicry and hybridity theory. Bhabha propounded that mimicry is created on account of ambivalence, it is built from difference, in fact this ambivalence is the mimicry tool to be effective (1984, p. 126). Furthermore, Robertson (in Darling-Wolf 2006, p. 193-194), explains the ambivalence of creating bodies that is interpreted in more than one way; meaning that in the context of mixed-race, they can be interpreted as part of Western as well as of Indonesian. Mimicry is not only owing to ambivalence, but the effect generated by mimicry itself is ambivalence too; on one hand, it benefits colonial authority but on the other hand it may put the authority in a distinct disadvantage.

Dyer also strengthens the argument of the presence of lighting techniques in the world of showbiz to make artists look whiter (1997). In the sense of ambivalence, this argument could apply similarly. Hybridity's ambivalence makes the identity undermined and easy to copy, so that the identity of hybrid is not a fixed identity. Therefore, the shift from being white to being non-white or from being non-white to being white is highly possible due to the nature of the identity which is open and undermined. Another important study by Ahmed (1999, p.101) suggests that mimicry of whiteness can be done by making alterations to one's speech, hair, fashion and gestures. This can be seen in artists who are not of mixed-race with less bright skin but the skin can be made to appear whiter. This is also possible with the use of graphics-editing program such as *Photoshop*, which allows us to manipulate one's skin color and appearance to look better. The discourse of the body has been a serious matter of concern to feminists. Similarly, Butler argued that "the body" itself is passive representation of cultural meaning, which we can interpret and give meaning, so "the body" is constructed (1999, p. 13). The body of non-local models would be interpreted differently from those of mixed-race referring to cultural meaning.

In the context of mixed-race, mimicry results from their look. The ambivalence of being white but which is not white enough takes the mixed-race to be at two distinctive points at the same time: as a Western woman and an Indonesian woman. In the context of whiteness and stereotype as modern women that I am going to analyze, the mixed-race are capable of using their ambivalence to convey Western power closer to the local culture so that they can take root in the society.

Moreover, Bhabha argued that the effect of mimicry could not only be profound but also disturbing. In this sense, mimicry is profound in a way that beauty refers to Western (colonial), and this can be seen in the one-sidedness of ads featured by mixed-race (hybrid) that offer ample opportunity for their beauty referring to Caucasian women. At the same time, when the mixed-race could not preserve this perception, the power of the authority may be seriously threatened. Threat may come up when mimicry failed to replicate the original, because it will mean that replicating failure could lose its authenticity.

Anne McClintock added arguments about mimicry and wrote that the concept of mimicry should not be reduced to one aspect, whether it is gender or colonial, but can be linked to one another to make this concept more powerful (2005, p.65). Thus in this research I will connect the concept of mimicry and hybridity in sense of whiteness and consumption.

However, the act of featuring mixed-race models in particular ads may also be intended to create distance between the readers and the models, i.e. displaying the other. This way, readers will compare themselves with the models so that a feeling of isolation then emerges that finally produces different feelings and dissatisfaction with their body. Bakhtin mentioned that through dialogue we can generate interaction and interplay with another person (in Hall 1997, p. 235). Hence, difference is important to allow us to be in contact with others, and difference too can help us create category. Difference is also essential in the sense that it can be the fundamental constitution of the self. Hall explained that role of difference in Lacan's term is that we "look from the place of the other" (1997, p. 237) and this experience will lead us to recognize our self and distinguish ourselves from the other.

Furthermore, Hall argued that the difference helps us to have a dialogue with the other. In the analysis part, I will use Hall's notion to understand the distance that ads create in order to have the feeling of alienation (1997). Sense of difference will lead us to realize the existence of the "other". The other is important to distinguish people on the basis of on different categories (how we categorize people) from us. In cases of advertisement images, sense of difference is very important for whitening commercial photos. Being different will lead to the experience of dissatisfaction.

### AIMS AND MATERIALS

Now the question that underlies my research is that how the concept of hybridity and mimicry in the context of mixed-race has been made to come into play in ads of beauty products. Despite the fact that mixed-race models do not feature ordinary products, I will observe how the concept of hybridity and mimicry operates in both types of

products. In addition, I am going to observe how the constructed pattern comes to be different when we consume beauty products and daily products.

As for the materials for examination, I took *Femina* magazine and *Nova* tabloid published in January – March 2011 as the sample for this research. The reason of this selection is that because *Femina* with 160.000 copies (*Femina*, 2011) and *Nova* with 626.084 copies (*Nova*, 2011) is the bestselling women's media with considerably wide female readership in Indonesia which both also accommodate local content. The ads I examined here are strongly based on the theme I am addressing, that is beauty of facial look, of body and of skin. I have decided on *Lux*, *Pond's* and *MarieFrance* since I have noticed that these ads have influential images and story to represent beauty on the basis of strong concept of hybridity and mimicry. As for daily products: *Royco*, *Mama Lemon* and *Scotch Brite*, beside not so many options as beauty products, I decide to take these ads to represent gender roles, cleanliness, otherness and whiteness that I would like to discuss in further analysis.

## ANALYSIS OF ADVERTISEMENTS

### **Royco: Being a Good Mother**



Image 1. Royco (Source: *Nova* 24, –30 January 2011 No. 1196)

This ad could be read as a signified in the sense that the mother or the woman is in charge of kitchen stuff or cooking issues. Furthermore as we can see, the central focus of this ad has not been the women, but the boy showing his big thumb. This image can then be interpreted that the women have to rely her identification as a mother on her child, and that meaning is likely accessible when she succeeds to satisfy her son with a dish of delicious food. She is required to have the ability to determine what is best to give to her family for that is what she is assigned in a family, i.e. to take a good care of her husband and her children. The connotation could be read as the mother here should be responsible for keeping everyone's appetite good by choosing excellent product of cooking ingredients and offering them the culinary sensation as well.

The woman in the ad is described as a caring and modest young mother. On the other hand, the boy does represent the male figure that needs to be taken care daily woman. Differing

from beauty products that commonly portray woman unaccompanied, most of daily products have always been featuring a woman in company with other people—could it be her children, husband or other housewives. This fact shows a connotation that woman featuring this product in the ad is described as a dependent woman who needs someone else to recognize her identity.

Note that neither light nor over make-up is given on the woman's face. In this way, she is described as usual and modest. There is simply no attempt to make this model look like or to create an imitation of the figure of a hybrid. She is described to represent common women in Indonesia. Make-up and light as a tool of making skin look whiter is not used here in this ads to the optimum degree.

### **Mala Lemor. Clean is White**



Image 2. *Mala Lemon* (Source: *Nova*, 28 February—6 March 2011 No. 1201)

The model appearing in this ad is Sarah Sechan, known as a host for several programs on television, who is also starring some comedy movies. She dresses casually in white shirt with very modest make-up and plainly simple hairdo; her short hair signifies fresh look and practical treatment. It would not be too difficult for us to notice how this product is featured by a local hook model with a disproportionately smaller figure of the model against the bigger-sized bottle of dishwashing liquid. This fact indeed signified that the advertisement demands the consumer to pay more attention to the product than to the model.

In addition to the color of Sarah's shirt and the image background in *Mala Lemon* ad, the notion of white domination is shown in the product's tag line as having the power to make dish 3X (three times) cleaner. The denotation of white is dominant as it is implied that the notion of white is similar to being clean, with respect to analysis by McClintock (1995) also to Dyer who argued that to look white is to look clean (1997, 76). Connotation of white as clean is very strong in this ad as shown by the model wearing white shirt which seemed to assert that even though she copes with housework of cleaning up the dishes but what she wears should be kept clean and white.

Sarah's white clothes which demonstrates the notion of mimicry is getting so confirms the notion



of mimicry. We can examine here that white signifies cleanliness, and this is in line with what Dyer argued that white color is meant to give the impression that the notion of white means purity (1997, p. 79). This ad attempts to transform the idea of white not by using the model but from signifier of white dish, white kitchen and white shirt.

### **Scotch-Brite: the Master and the Maid**



Image 3. *Scotch-Brite* (Source: *Nova*, 28 February –6 March 2011 No. 1201)

What attracts me the most in this ad is the virtual presence of a maid who is represented by the avatar. In order to explain the avatar in this ad I would like to adopt an explanation offered by Holzwart (2006, p. 20) suggesting that an avatar is the representation of a user manifested by computer's technology; in this context, an avatar does represent a servant.

The avatar itself is a connotative hybrid, in the sense that she is not human. In this case, the woman is the original and the maid is the hybrid; the latter looks like a human but not a real human. The human figure represents her difference from the avatar; the two represent dichotomy as black and white, man and woman, in this context the dichotomy between the avatar and the human.

Furthermore, the woman and the avatar indicate what McClintock pointed out as icon of maid and master, dirt and cleanliness (1995, p.138). The colorful avatar is there to confirm the woman's presence in the ad assuring the viewers that the model has a companion from significant other, in this sense is her servant. The avatar is signified to abolish the image of the model's sole responsibility to handle dishwashing matters.

The avatar does also signify its position of being non-member of the family, which immediately creates distance or detachment between the woman and her maid. Unlike the avatar used in an online game or at Yahoo! Messenger that typically represents its user, the avatar in this ad appears so vividly clear to represent a maid far as an avatar. It is

common here in Indonesia that a family employs a maidservant in the house. However, there has been a reluctance to show a maidservant in the form of real human, and this agrees with what McClintock noted that maidservants are undeniably made to be invisible in terms of figure but are shown only in terms of their work; that is to say, their figure is to be made as invisible as possible (1995, p.163). The reluctance to visualize a maidservant in the form of human is then resolved by the use of avatar. This is similar to what was carried out during the rule of Queen Victoria (*the Monkey Brand soap*) that used a monkey as a hybrid to replace human figure (McClintock, 1995). The reluctance to present women in domestic affairs is finally substituted by monkeys.

The use of avatar also underlines difference of class between them, between the mistress and the maidservant, between reality and virtual reality, between the original and the hybrid. We can also notice distance here between the mistress and the avatar for they do not seem to make any physical contact or interaction even though they are in close proximity to each other. The avatar is standing a bit farther in the back so that its position is slightly a few steps farther from the mistress. While in ad of *Royco* the intimacy of a son and a mother is clearly demonstrated, we hardly grab an intimate association between the woman and the avatar despite their being close to each other; they seem to be two different mingled elements.

#### **Lux: Soap and Eiffel**



Image 4 Lux (Source: *Femina*, 19–25 February 2011 No. 7)

Dressed in white gown, the model looks shining out of the dark background. The dark background has made the body of the model to show a stark contrast from the background. This technique is also used in *Marie France* ad to affirm the distinction of dark and bright. Connotations of glamour and beauty are infused to the perfume. This is understandable since perfume is the signified of beauty, glamour and modern, while Paris is the city which is famous for its perfume all over the world. The image of Eiffel tower is deliberately set to insert the connotation of perfume with Paris, and Eiffel here is also used obviously to stand for the meaning of globalization and beauty.

It is interesting to compare *Lux* with other ad, since *Lux* ad has connotation of cry. It is my reason to

expand my analysis part about *Lux* ad in a further detail when I tried to compare all the advertisements.

### ***Pond's*, White is Beauty**



Image 5. *Pond's* (Source: *Femina* 12-18 February 2011 No. 6 and *Nova* 7-13 February 2011 No. 1981)

Taking from what Hall has argued, I then try to examine why I can come to think that white is beautiful, without even considering how the perception came to exist. In order to analyze this matter, Hall took us back to the slavery times, in which black (natural) as their characteristics is reduced to be subordinate, primitive, and uncivilized. This perception emerged because of their difference. Hall argued, naturalization is something fixed and unchangeable (1997, p. 245), in slavery the white masters construct a perception that the characteristics of their black slaves are uncivilized and primitive as a matter of naturalization. This ideology had become their reason to undertake control of their slaves. Furthermore, Hall wrote that this conception of blackness (skin) as natural and primitivism (culture) became interchangeable. It is one concept, undividable and fixed and therefore, when we refer to black then our conception about black people will lead to primitivism and uncivilization. This concept has causes black to be about not only skin but also about dark as a symbol of darkness, criminal and bad people.

To expand Hall's argument I will also include McClintock's idea about soap and imperialism (2006, p. 210), soap is dependent on the colonial culture (imperial culture) and the nature of being colonized (colonized nature) as a dichotomy of black/white. Blacks are marked as 'natural', which in this context implies someone who is not civilized, uncivilized, wild and people who are "dirty" and "tainted" that need to be purified. In addition, in the dichotomy of the imperial culture and the nature of being colonized, white markings suggests "cultured, clean and pure."

My point is that *Pond's* keeps two important notions in the ad; the first one is the idea that whiteness is something natural so that the existence is unnecessarily questioned. In this context, the colonial history by the Dutch in Indonesia helps the concept of naturalization to linger on. The second idea is that what happens as soon as the concept of whiteness has been accepted as a fixed truth. Subsequently,



whitening products come to use the concept of natural/cultural again but in reverse. The concept of skin as something fixed is redefined as something that can be changed (culture) and suggests the concept of happiness since having white skin is considered something natural— as a logical consequence of possessing white skin. These two concepts seemingly in contrast actually have the opportunity to cooperate well to develop a view that white is equal to beauty. It is no surprise that a person like me who grew in a non white culture finds it no longer suspicious and therefore considers the sentence true. When I am using *Pond's*, I come to understand that the concept of white is a changeable thing (culture) with the purpose of becoming white and beautiful, happy and successful (nature).

### **Marie France; the Breakthrough**



Image 6 Marie France (Source: *Femina* 19— 25 February 2011 No. 7)<sup>13</sup>

*Marie France Bodyline* is one of the most well-known slimming programs for those who desire to have favorable body contours. This ad calls this program a breakthrough. This is visualized by the female model (her name is Carissa Putri) that seems to have destroyed the glass, which is now broken into pieces. This is a signified that not only mark her out of the old chained body (which is covered because it is not interesting), but also signifies her freedom of a woman, to make her as a woman who is independent and confident.

The black background emphasizes the model's dresses. Dyer mentioned that light and darkness are used to distinguish particular group from the poor (1997, p. 121), and in this context the signifier is the use of black background that turns the

light around Carissa to glow. As for the signified, this treatment does reinforce the definite contrast of black and white. Black represents the past, the notion of unclearness and bleakness. The glowing light has enabled the advertiser to strongly promote the new Carissa just after taking *Marie France's* program. She is portrayed as being free, independent and happy. The accessible connotation makes the image of mixed-race woman even stronger as a happy, independent, free and beautiful. In addition to breaking the glass that has concealed her from the outside world, the body of Carissa the model also emits light in which the light is emanating from the whole body of hers. Still the white color of the body is stronger than the light.

### Whiteness and Cleanliness

Examining *Pond's* ad as the example, I would like to propose Hall's argument about how to read the other (Hall, 1997). Hall emphasized how one culture interprets the other differently. However, in this context the model is not from other cultures (Western-face), she is in fact a part of local culture (mixed-race), which means she is part of us although she is portrayed as a hybrid. Instead of using real Western people to represent whiteness, whitening product advertisers hire mixed-race or Asian (Chinese, Japanese or Korean who are whiter than Indonesian women) for their consumers in Indonesia, these techniques also lead to ambivalence. It is in this context that the process of mimicry is shaped, in which local women are strongly recommended to copy how mixed-race look like, that is to be whiter. Hybridity is what Pieterse (2001) called 'in-betweenness', they are neither Western nor Indonesian. This condition makes the mixed-race easily welcomed as part of Indonesia, even though they are not purely Indonesians.

Moreover, I am thus deeply interested in how the ads inseminate light effect into both ads, in which beauty products are overwhelmed by light, make-up and retouching compared to the ads of daily products. It just seems that local models featuring daily product are unlucky since they are portrayed as being modest with tan effect, while the mixed-race is spoiled with all the possible technology to turn them into whiter models they way they can look. It is relevant that Dyer argued that white clothing gives the effect of glow (1997, p. 124).

At the same time the attribute such as light, make-up, and retouching has created greater opportunity to make copy-mimicry-. The character of ambivalence possessed by the mixed-race enables them to imitate and to be imitated at the same time. The model that is not a mixed-race can be turned to look like a mixed-race with the help of technology and the other way round. I am convinced that if a local model is dressed in fabulous clothes (showing glamour), adorned with tremendous make-up that shows her whiteness, and lighting effect to have her look whiter, then she will also be able to be one of those mixed-race; she will be a hybrid emulating a hybrid. However we hardly find this technique applied in daily products, I assumed the absence of ambivalence in daily products in order to create big difference between local-face and mixed-race clear, I will discuss this further below.

In this position, mixed-race is portrayed as idealized woman, despite the fact  
Their presence as the

standard of beauty cannot be separated from the Western woman as the standard of beauty. With the existence of mimicry, they can include portions of the standards of beauty, because they are considered white in a non white culture. Hence, they should maintain and indulge themselves in their whiteness to distinguish from the local face. Instead, the local face is depicted in simplicity, but still the influence of light and make-up is important to give the impression of glow and luminosity.

Furthermore, Dyer argued that white women are normally attributed to glow since glow signifies the presence of light that surrounds their body, unlike shine of which the light bounces back so that the effect of the latter is not as powerful as glow (1997, p. 122). The effect of glow is undoubtedly making the white skin of the mixed-race models even more powerful that involuntarily distinguishes them from those of non white-skinned models. Expanding on his argument, I argue that access to whiteness relies on one's ability to embody the affective identities constructed as part of the product (read as *beauty*). Whiteness here is not simply coded as embodying specific biological features, or originating from a specific place, let alone "race," but also as involving feelings of *Pond's*ism, *Lux*ism and *Marie France*ism, the feeling that create beauty products as identification of who we are.

At the same time, what is interesting is how we related whiteness to cleanliness. In *Lux* ad, for instance, is demanding a cleansing of the body to which according to Bhabha that skin is ultimately a sign in order to be distinguished between the colonized and the colonizer (Bhabha, 1994), thus in this sense mixed-race models are the evidence to distinguish between colonizer and colonized. In contrast, *Mala Lemon* ads are also soap ads, but the objects to be cleaned are not the human skin but merely the dish. In contrast to cleaning dishes, in the ad the dish looks very clean after the use of soap and that is the visible difference. In *Lux* ad, we will not be able to see the model transformation as the subject of cleaning; the model has maintained her beauty without undergoing a transformation process before she disclosed using *Lux* soap on his body.

The very point we can also notice about the daily ad for instance *Mala Lemon* ad is that it clearly displays steps to remove the dirt from the dish. The dirt removal signifies a process of transformation: from dirtiness to cleanness. The attempt to clean the dish from the dirt can be interpreted as an attempt to gain purity for the purpose of taking the dirt away from the dish. In this sense, the dirt has become what McClintock referred to as the memory trace of working class and female labor (1995, p.154), in which the dirt serves as evidence that the woman belongs to working class. In relation to my analysis, the description or the appearance of dirt is made in such a way that we note and then distinguish working class (in this context, the local-look model) from upper-class woman (mixed race). The dirt attached to the hands of a working class woman is convincing evidence of their existence as the working class, and this very evidence would not just fade away since it has evolved into an idea that sticks in the memory that she is holding the dirt. In this context, the dishwashing liquid is the medium that separates the filthy from the clean. However, a significant difference goes for beauty products; in *Lux*, for instance, the soap is indeed intended to wash the body (where the dirt resides).

In *Mala Lemon*, the cleaning activity is carried out merely to make the filthy dish dirt-free as opposed to clean the hands that have come in close contact with the dirt, and that the dirt then remains embedded in the memory as the divisive evidence of local models and the mixed-race ones. For that reason, the mixed-race is not allowed to be in contact with filth in order to maintain purity. It can be construed that body is a medium of cleaning on beauty products and the dish on daily products; and this notion has generated different impacts on the models as the subject. In daily products, the subject (model) will never experience any change since the purpose of the cleaning is not meant for the sake of herself, unlike the subject in beauty products, of which body goes through a transformation because body is meant to be the final purpose of cleaning, that is the clear separation of the filthy and the purity.

### CONSUMPTION AND HAPPINESS

I would like to argue that mixed-race image in beauty ads needs to be constructed in order to get beauty image of the products, and for that reason they really rely on their models' images. Instead, the local models are getting into domestic sector to strengthen their localities as well as their traditional role. Among the signifiers in daily products mostly shown as the domestic representation are kitchen, bowl and dishes. Exploration of the model's body is not visible here; the make-up, clothes and the use of crude light are all simple and modest. The central idea of their ads is the ability and excellence of their products. The presence of the model is as a supporter, seen not only on the size of the image model, but also attempts to limit the chances of the model into the limelight than the model itself.

Linking with my research the perception of mixed-race as more beautiful and having more leisure time does actually come one of the mixed-race people from the portrayal in the ads. What is interesting for me also links this fact with colonial time, the Dutch colonizing Indonesia. Colonial discourse is exposed obviously in Indonesian ads, where Indonesian media is full of representations of light-skinned people 'except for drivers, maids and comedians' that the image of whiteness becomes associated with social status.

From Saraswati's arguments I can cite here how ads generate happiness after consuming the products. I would like to use this argument on how the happiness can be interpreted differently between beauty and daily products, but they share the same construction on how to induce the consumers in order to feel happy after consuming the products. Moreover, Saraswati mentioned that whitening ads create happiness through practices, and skin-whitening products have changed to be one of essential necessities in life (2010 p. 28). In daily products the happiness is constructed when the woman finished her job well as housewives or as mother. Should it not be forgotten that in daily products happiness emerges when mother is successful.

In *Royco* ad, for instance, the woman is shown to have made her son eat a lot and happy (even though the meal might not be healthy due to the chemical substances contained in the ingredients). In this ad, we can see how the mother's success and satisfaction as

mother. It is her son who says that the food is delicious which is legitimating her success to have met what he needs.

Furthermore the happiness derived from consuming daily products is associated with how they can please other people, while happiness benefited from using beauty products signifies how people consume the products without the need to reflect with other people. It is different from beauty product, even though they (mostly Indonesia woman) are not living in that kind of life. However, the ads allow them to have a dream and fantasy about being an independent woman, enjoying leisure time and the most important one is being beautiful. This fantasy is the fuel to keep the woman to build the dream, by buying the product to grow a fantasy like the model of the ads the purpose is not how to achieve the goal but how to keep the fantasy alive that keeps the woman buying the products. The point I want to make here is that the mixed-race existence is needed in order to keep the fantasy alive. Not only do they represent the princess in old bedtime stories, but also stand for life that they do not have.

On the other hand, consuming beauty products is shown in a totally different way, that there is no significant 'others' shown as an individual — the happiness is embedded purely in them being able to enjoy their beauty (white face, slim body, nice smell and luxurious clothes). The significant other may not come from other people but replace other object as fetish. Notice that they need to portray as an untouched dream since the obsession to achieve something like them is almost impossible for it is not easy to change your appearance if we refer to mixed-race as the reference. Beauty seems to be a grand theme for beauty product as the gate of successes. Daily products lay one's identity on others, that is, they are not described as independent and free individuals. Models of daily products are happy too, but their happiness is possible on account of completing particular task. The completed task is then brought to other persons for proposal or agreement so that the task doer can be identified and this way she is neither free nor independent.

I remember when I was a child; my parents kept retelling the story of Snow White or Cinderella as bedtime stories. The woman in daily products is the one who needs to work in order to satisfy the family. The fantasy is to keep a woman away from exhausted works just like a princess to be saved by a prince. Seasonings fantasy is less convincing when it is not equipped with all the attributes of beauty. It seemed to us that the advertisement consistently offers only stereotypical images of women while glorifying and privileging the activities of the mixed-race. The woman appearing in the ads of daily products is dreaming of a success in the domestic environment.

According to Bhabha (2004), mimicry in the practice of a colonial cultural discourse strictly split relationship between the colonialist and the colonized. In the context of this research, if the mixed-race fails to imitate the authenticity of western models' look, then it could disrupt the hegemony of Caucasian beauty as the standard of beauty. Hence, there are parameters and controls to maintain the original existence as the standard of beauty, because mixed-race is a hybrid of the original, and so they should be able to imitate the original (Western woman). In

the recognition that the



Western woman is the symbol of beauty, because the existence of mixed-race resembling a Caucasian woman reinforces the concept of beauty, thus confirming the existence of the white women as the original. Mixed-race is practically a transitional agent of Western woman from whom they derive (original). In order to strengthen the position of mixed-race as standard of beauty as well as beauty in ads, they enjoyed the privilege of their freedom and beauty, as opposed to the local face that must be working hard in domestic work to serve their family such as cooking and washing dishes.

What is interesting is that mimicry found in ads of daily products, as McClintock pointed out, is shown by the ability of women to embrace idleness (1995, p.162). At this point women are required to possess the ability to demonstrate labor of leisure, in the sense that the work they perform is indeed enjoyable for them instead of burdening themselves. It is necessary that women have their domestic work concealed, so that there will be a distinct gap between public sphere and domestic sphere. Women are to hide their weariness despite their exhaustive domestic work, the way they are presented in ads of daily products in which the woman is depicted as being happy after completing the household chores, no matter how hard and how much the work is.

Products like *Royco*, *Mala Lemon* and *Scotch-Brite* are designed for women to get their household chores done more quickly and more easily. With *Royco* at hand, mothers should never trouble themselves anymore to do peeling, slicing, and grilling when preparing cooking ingredients because *Royco* will just be enough to turn their cooking special. This way they can serve the whole family the best cooking experience ever in a relatively short time and less trouble. Similarly, using the advertised dishwashing liquid it is no longer necessary that women clean the dish over and over just to remove the toughest grease on the dish. This is possible due to the power of the special substances contained in the liquid that shall help any mothers take the dirt away without too much effort. The speed and the practicality offered by ads of daily products enable women to enjoy their leisure time and to consume beauty product for the sake of their own pleasure.

### CONCLUSION

Whiteness serves as a significant mechanism for mixed-race to dominate Indonesia's advertising industry. Beauty is standardized referring to Western women as meeting the ideal criteria. This drives the emergence of idea that mixed-race models that are hybrids of Western woman are made the standard of beauty in non white culture. In this context, mixed-race refers to what Bhabha mentioned as mimicry — white which is not completely white. However, mixed-race women have benefited from this condition since they are likely to be well accepted due to their existence as hybrids that can bridge the West and the local and the message of the ad can be transferred more easily to us the viewers knowing that the mixed-race are indeed part of us. The mixed-race are capable of being familiar and at the same time creating alienation for the viewers for the sake of strengthening the idea that Western woman is identical to the standard of beauty. Moreover, the distance is

also necessary to distinguish the mixed-race from the local face so that the two remain distinctive. For instance we can see that there is hardly use of make-up, lighting or fabulous clothes to be put on for local-face, and they are simply made to look the way they are in order to create distance from the mixed-raced. The similar treatment has been customarily found in all local face women employed to be the models for daily products.

At the beginning, it was difficult to determine whether a model (in beauty product) is of mixed-race or not, the ambivalence inherent themselves has made it hard enough for me to decide, but then I learn that ads of e.g. whitening product has benefited from this concept of ambivalence has to grow some distance between the mixed-race models and the readers (due to the latter's whiteness) and in the same time to create no distance since the models are not white enough compared to the Western models. This ambivalence has in turn provided the opportunity to imitate and to be imitated at the very same time.

I have also discovered in this research that ad is one of media to grow a dream—a dream that will only be achieved once we use the advertised product. It is also a dream that ads of beauty products offer—a dream to be a woman with attractive appearance, independence and being the centre of attention. Leisure is the core value that ads of beauty products offer, that is by using the advertised product then we are consuming pleasure for ourselves. As for ads of daily products, it is a dream of becoming a woman who is doing well in domestic affairs that advertisers sell. That is on how to become a good mother and wife who manages the family well and whose success is represented by their skill and craftsmanship in providing the best meal, cleaning the dish to make sure all the kitchen utensils perfectly hygienic as efficient as possible with the help of the advertised products.

Unlike models of daily product that require others to identify themselves for their success, models of beauty product are depicted as being more independent while overlooking identification from others. This strengthens the stereotype of Western women who are more independent and courageous in determining their life, while local women continue to play their traditional role as women who need other to identify them.

#### REFERENCES

- Ahmed, Sara (1999): "She'll Wake up One of These Days and Find She's Turned into a Nigger": Passing through Hybridity," *Theory Culture & Society*, vol. 16:2, (p 87-106).
- Bhabha, Homi (2004): *The Location of Culture*, London: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (1999): *Gender Trouble: Feminism and Subversion of Identity*, London: Routledge.

- Darling-Wolf, Fabienne (2006): The Men and Women of Non-No: Gender, Race, and Hybridity in Two Japanese Magazines", *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, vol. 23:3, (p 181-199).
- Dyer, Richard (1997): *White: Essays on Race and Culture*, London: Routledge.
- Hall, Stuart (1997): "The Spectacle of The 'Other'", in Stuart Hall (eds)(1997) *Representation. Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*, London: Sage, (p 223-290).
- Holzwarth, Martin. Janiszewski, Chris & Neumann, Marcus (2006): "The Influence of Avatars on Online Consumer Shopping Behavior." *Journal of Marketing*, vol. 70:4 , (p 19-36). [online] Available at <http://www.atypon-link.com/AMA/doi/pdf/10.1509/jmkg.70.4.19?cookieSet=1><Accessed 29 May 2011.
- McClintock, Anne (1995): *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest*, London: Routledge.
- Pieterse, Jan (2001): Hybridity, So What?: The Anti-Hybridity Backlash and The Riddles of Recognition", *Theory, Culture & Society*, vol. 18: 2-3, (p 219-245).
- Saraswati, Ayu (2010): "Cosmopolitan Whiteness: The Effects and Affects of Skin-Whitening Advertisements in a Transnational Women's Magazine in Indonesia" , *Meridians Journal*, vol 10: 4, (p 15-41). [online] Available at: <http://www.istor.org/bss/10.2979/meridians.2010.10.2.15><Accessed 28 January 2011.
- Yulianto, Ita (2007): *Pesona 'Barat': Analisa Kritis-Historis tentang Kesadaran Warna Kulit di Indonesia*, Jogjakarta: Jalasutra.

#### Magazine and Tabloid

*Femina* No. 06, 12-18 February 2011

*Nova*, No. 1196, 24-30 January 2011

*Nova* No. 1981, 7-13 February 2011

*Nova* No. 1201, 28 Feb-6 March 2011

#### Websites:

*Femina*, 2011. *Femina Media Kit*. [online] Available at: <http://www.FeminaGroup.com/media.kit/001/6>> [Accessed 20 May 2011]

*Nova*, 2011. Our Brands [online] Available at: <http://www.oramedia-malalah.com/brand/Nova>> [Accessed 20 May 2011]