

# THE IMPACTS OF CERTIFICATION POLICY ON TEACHERS' WORKING PERFORMANCE: A CASE OF RIAU

**Almasdi Syahza**

Universitas Riau, Pekanbaru-Indonesia

**Suarman**

Universitas Riau, Pekanbaru-Indonesia

## **Abstract**

As professionals, teachers have an important role to play in primary, secondary, and early childhood education. Teacher certification as an effort to boost teacher's qualification is also expected to improve learning quality and quality education continuously. This study aims at investigating the impact of teacher certification on teachers' working performance. *The Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA)* was used to obtain accurate information related to pedagogic, personal, social, and professional competences. The competences of both certified and uncertified teachers were measured against 78 indicators, and the impact of the implementation of the government's policy on teachers' teaching performance was measured using *t-test*. Results showed that overall there is a difference between certified and uncertified teachers. However, in terms of both junior and senior high school teachers' pedagogic and professional competences, no difference was found. Statistical tests showed that there is no difference in working performance between certified and uncertified teachers.

**Key words:** Certification, teachers' working performance, policy implementation

## **Introduction**

The nature of national development is the development of Indonesian people in totality as well as the development of all societies. The success of this development is no longer measured in terms of economy, but rather by virtue of the extent to which this development can enhance the quality of human resources. In other words, a sustainable development nowadays is not only supported by an economic development, but also by the development of human resources. Thus, an investment in human resources should be the top priority.

The improvement of human resources is a pressing demand as a result of the rapid and complex development. The development in economy, industry, information current, and science and technology clearly demands qualified human resources. In the long term the development of human resources will be done in a four-tiered policy: 1) the improvement of a quality life which includes physical and spiritual quality; 2) the improvement of productive human resources along with its dissemination; 3) the improvement of developing human quality and the mastery of science and technology, and 4) the development of institution which include human-resources-supporting facilities.

Currently, Indonesian human resources have seen to have potentials. The rapid growth of low quality human resources can be benefited optimally as a source of development. They are a dynamic factor in economic development for a long term along with science and technology. Thus, the quality human resources are affected by the improvement of quality education.

Every nation needs quality human resources, as they positively impinge upon the development of a nation in all fields. For this reason, every nation is struggle to enhance its human resources through the improvement of quality education. This is because quality

education contributes to the creation of quality human resources, which in the end supports the realization of the goal of national development.

To attain the target of quality learning for all educational levels, the government issued the Law on Teacher (Number 14, 2005), which was implemented in teacher certification. The following law has been used as a legal basis for conducting teacher certification: 1) Law Number 20, 2003 on the national educational system; 2) Law Number 14, 2005 on teachers; 3) Government Regulation Number 19, 2005 on the standard of national education; 4) Government Regulation Number 74, 2008 on teachers; 5) the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation Number 16, 2007 on the standard of qualification and teacher competences. In an attempt to enhance the quality of teachers and to implement these government policies, teachers must be certified.

Certification has been conducted and then evaluated since 2007. The evaluation was done so that its accountability could be ensured and could in the end have a beneficial effect on the improvement of learning process. The government's policy manifested through certification was targeted to the improvement of quality education from elementary to tertiary level. Besides, the government provided allowances as an attempt to improve teacher's welfare.

The improvement of quality education is determined by the readiness of human resources involved in educational process. Teachers are one of human components in the teaching and learning process. They play a role in shaping potential human resources. They are expected to be able to teach in classroom and outside of classroom. Teaching is in fact one of the components of the aforementioned competences, and teachers ought to skillfully master it, which is no easy feat. This is because teachers face a group of students who are the future leaders. Experienced teachers generally have the mastery and skill in teaching.

Skill in teaching is a professional skill created through teaching and learning process. Professional skill is a supporting factor in teaching and learning. Teachers' skill in delivering teaching materials to students is a determining factor in the attainment of learning achievement. It is this skill that teachers must be committed to.

Professional teachers can produce quality education, which can be accomplished through the creation of enjoyable learning climates. In the teaching and learning process not only students, but also teachers who are expected to have motivation so that the latter can push themselves and their students in the learning activities. In addition, teachers should arouse students' learning spirit and empower themselves optimally in the teaching and learning process. Motivation should serve as a learning drive to improve teachers' and learners' capability in teaching and learning activities. A motivated person can create strength in himself to act, which impinges upon the ways and capabilities in learning. This will further impact on the learners' ability in digesting learning materials.

All teachers' activities in their professional development can be observed from their working performances. These performances are working ability and working achievement exhibited by teachers to obtain optimal learning results. They also reflect teachers' activities in carrying out their profession. These activities mirror teachers' efforts in attaining the already set up goals. Finally, they are the results of working performances which can be demonstrated through qualified working results, working punctuality, initiative, skill, and good communication.

Law Number 14, 2005 on Teachers stipulates that teachers are professional educators whose main duties are to educate, teach, guide, direct, train, assess, and evaluate students in such levels as early childhood formal education, elementary, and secondary education. Professional teachers should possess the following: Bachelor Degree or diploma (D-IV), the mastery of competences (pedagogic, professional, social, and personal), certification, physical and spiritual health, and ability in realizing the goal of national education.

Teachers bear a status as professionals in elementary, secondary, and early childhood education and are assigned to teach in line with the constitutional regulations. The recognition of this status has been evident in the certification. Law Number 14, 2005 on Teachers defines professional as an activity carried out by someone and becomes a source of livelihood which needs skills and proficiency that satisfy quality standards, certain norms as well as profession education. As professionals, teachers are expected to improve teachers' dignity and their role as learning agents and to improve the quality of national education. Certification as an effort to enhance teachers' quality is expected to boost learning quality and education in Indonesia in a sustainable way.

According to Anwar Prabu Mangkunegara (2005), factors which impinge upon teachers' performance include ability and motivation. Ability consists of intellectual intelligent and knowledge skill. Teachers with higher educational background, specific expertise, and skillful in carrying out daily duties are more likely to achieve the expected outcomes. Learning activities will be more effective provided that teachers are places in accordance with their expertise. Uhur Suharsaputra (2012) points out that teachers' working performance is basically a performance carried out by teachers as educators. Quality teaching performance has the potential in determining quality education, as teachers directly involve in the teaching and learning process in an educational institution. To understand what the teachers' working performance is and how it is manifested, we will first present the notion of performance and how it is managed in an efforts to attain organizational goal effectively and efficiently.

As far as the skill is concerned, teachers need to be trained. Dominants factors which can improve this skill are a strong drive within the teachers to work hard. Hamah B. Uno (2008) asserts that motivation is factors that determine one's working performance. To what extent the motivation affects one's working performance depends on how frequent one is encouraged to improve oneself. This is a process which pushes teachers so that their behavior can be geared to real efforts to achieve the established goals. Moreover, S.P. Hasibuan says that motivation is the instillation of a driving force, which can create one's passion in work so that one can work collaboratively, effectively, and in integrative ways to achieve work satisfaction.

Performance assessment is a system of outcome achievement of a company or organization of individuals who work in and for that company and organization (Payaman J. Simanjuntak, 2005). According to Sulistyorini, quoted in Mukhlisin (2009), teachers' working performance is an individual teacher's or a group of people's (teachers') success in carrying out their duties and responsibilities and an ability to attain the established goals and standards. Eko Putro Widoyoko (2010) says that teachers' working performance is teachers' ability to demonstrate their skills and competences in real workplaces. Teachers' real world is classroom where they help learners learn. Keke T. Aritonang (2005) explains that teachers' working performance is teacher perceptions of accomplishments related to quality work, responsibility, honesty, cooperation and initiative.

In the process of improving working quality, work should be measureable. To find out whether working activities are attainable, working indicators can be used. According to Usman and Musarofah (2008) there are some indicators against which teachers' roles in improving teaching-learning qualities are measured. They are the ability in planning teaching and learning, the ability in carrying out teaching and learning, and the ability in assessing teaching and learning results.

Furthermore, Me Clelland puts forward six characteristics of teachers who have motives of attaining great achievement. They include 1) possessing high self-responsibility; 2) taking risks; 3) possessing realistic goals; 4) benefiting the whole working plans and striving to realize their goals; 5) benefiting concrete feedbacks in the working activities, and

6) seeking opportunities to realize the programmed plans (Anwar Prabu Mangkunegara, 2005).

Teachers' performance can be improved provided that schools can create conducive working climates, provide clear job descriptions and working guidelines, give guidance and directions to teachers who are facing obstacles in carrying out their duties, give opportunities to enrich and deepen their teaching experiences as well as develop teachers' motivation and working ethos (Payman J. Simanjuntak, 2005).

For this reason, as an actualization of teachers' duties, the government through the Ministry of Education and Culture mandated by the Law Number 20, 2003 on the National Education System, Law Number 14, 2005 on Teachers, and the government regulation Number 19, 2005 on the Standard of National Education facilitates teachers to develop their profession sustainable ways. The Sustainable Profession Development Program (PKB) is directed toward minimizing the gap between teachers' knowledge, skill, social and personal competences they possess now and what will be expected of them related to their profession in the future.

The PKB was developed on the basis of teachers' performance profiles as a manifest of Teachers' Performance Assessment supported by self-assessment. For teachers whose performance assessments were below the standard competences or had low working performance, their participation in the PKB was mandatory; by contrast, for teachers who had achieved the standard competences, the PKB should be geared to the professional improvement so as to satisfy the future demands in the context of giving a qualified learning service to learners (Kompasiana, 2011). From the above accounts, the following research questions are formulated: 1) are certified teachers able to improve learning quality in schools?; 2) what impacts the certification has teachers' working performance?

As the agents of change, the quality of teachers determines their teaching capability and skills, which means that they must be professional in their expertise. This study specifically discovers 1) certified teachers' capability in a learning process, so that learning quality and education in school can be improved; and 2) finds out the impact of teacher certification on the improvement of teachers' working performance in schools. This study also finds out the impact of certification policy on the quality education and teachers' performance in secondary education.

## Method

This study used survey with a developmental research method as a source of primary data. In so doing, general information about the impact of government's educational policy on teachers' performance can be obtained. The study was conducted in three regencies: Kampar, Rokan Hulu, and Pelalawan. It is hoped that the selected schools (which are assumed to have different infrastructures) could represent the population in these regencies. From these selected regencies, teachers and schools were determined on purpose with the following criteria: 1) the samples hailed from state schools; 2) they have at least five-year teaching experience; 3) they specialized themselves in certain subjects.

To obtain accurate information the Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA) were employed. This method is a participatory approach used to elicit general data/information and assessment in the field within a relatively short period. In this method, the information gathered is limited to that needed in line with the aim of the study. Yet, the source of information was obtained in depth, so as to have a complete picture of the issue being investigated.

To find out the impact of the implementation of the policy on teachers' performance, a comparison test (between certified and uncertified teachers) was used. This performance is

seen from the four competences: pedagogic, personal, social, and professional. These competences were assessed against 14 indicators and 78 sub-indicators by a team of researchers and principals. After *t-test* had been conducted, descriptive analysis was done in order to get a complete picture of both certified and uncertified junior and senior high school teachers

## Results and Discussion

### 1. The Working Performance Of Junior And Senior High School Teachers

As stipulated in the Law on teachers, No. 14, 2005 and the Regulation of the Minister of Education, and teacher competence, teachers as the learning agents at schools need to boost their quality. In this respect, teacher certification has become a conduit for making teachers more professional and for improving their welfare. However, to attain a status of certified teachers, a teacher must fulfill some requirements and conditions. Certified teachers, it is expected, ought to enhance their performance and to exhibit their professionalism as an educator both in school and in the society.

Results from this study show that there is a difference between certified and uncertified teachers in the three regencies above. From the competences (pedagogic, personal, social, and professional), 78, 38 % certified teachers demonstrated “very good” and “good” working performance, while those uncertified showed 41, 38 %. This is confirmed from the statistical test that  $t_{\text{value}} (2,6892) > t_{\text{table}} (1,9800)$ . Certified teachers’ working performance scores higher than that of uncertified teachers. This is supported by such competences as personal and social, as a teacher must possess a unique feature like good personality and social spirit (high tolerance). The statistical analysis is presented in Table 1 below.

Table 1. The results of performance assessment of senior high school teachers

No	Kategori (Category)	Sertifikasi (Certified)		Nonsertifikasi (uncertified)	
		Frekuensi (frequency)	%	Frekuensi (frequency)	%
1	Amat Baik (Very good)	7	18,92	1	3,45
2	Baik (good)	22	59,46	11	37,93
3	Cukup (fair)	8	21,62	17	58,62
Jumlah (total)		37	100,00	29	100,00
Rataan skor kinerja (Average)		45,135		42,241	
Standar deviasi (standard deviation)		21,731		16,547	
Nilai t-hitung (4 Kompetensi) t-value (four competences)		2,6892			
Nilai t-hitung (Pedagogik) t-value (pedagogic)		0,2280			
Rataan skor kinerja (average)		22,405		22,276	
Nilai t-hitung (Profesional) t-value (professional)		1,8667			
Rataan skor kinerja (average)		4,622		4,103	
Nilai t-tabel (t-table)		1,9800			

Junior high school teachers’ performance in the chosen regencies does not differ greatly from those of senior high school. Overall, there is a difference in working

performance between certified and uncertified teachers, which is evident from the  $t_{\text{test}}$  ( $t_{\text{value}} 9,5082 > t_{\text{table}} 1,9800$ ). Certified teachers' working performance shows "good" and "very good" (95, 56%), while those uncertified show only 21, 43%. For junior high teachers, none achieve the category of "very good". This result can be seen in Table 2 below.

However, from the perspective of professional and pedagogical competences, there is no significant difference between certified and uncertified teachers, which is proven in the result from the  $t_{\text{test}}$  ( $t_{\text{value}} (1,6980) < t_{\text{table}} (1,9800)$ ). The average of pedagogic and professional performance also shows similar results, suggesting that from both pedagogic and professional competences, certified teachers and uncertified teachers have not yet showed better working performance compared to uncertified teachers.

Seen from both pedagogic and professional competence of junior and senior high school teachers, no significant difference in working performance was found, which has been evidence in the statistical test of both certified and uncertified teachers (See Table. 3 for the analysis). The pedagogical and professional competences of certified teachers show no significant difference with those of uncertified teachers, meaning that no real difference in teaching method and teaching preparation in teaching-learning interaction was found. The determinant working components for the pedagogic competence include: 1) the mastery of students' characteristics, 2) the mastery of learning principles, 3) the evolution of curricula, 4) learning activities, 5) the development of students' potential, 6) communication with students; 7) assessment and evaluation. Of these seven components, it is components 1-5 that certified teacher lack.

Table 2. The results of performance assessment of junior high school teachers.

No	Kategori (category)	Sertifikasi (certified)		Nonsertifikasi (uncertified)	
		Frekuensi (frequency)	%	Frekuensi (frequency)	%
1	Amat Baik (very good)	4	8,89	0	-
2	Baik (good)	39	86,67	9	21,43
3	Cukup (fair)	2	4,44	33	78,57
Jumlah (total)		45	100,00	42	100,00
Rataan kinerja (average)		45,511		39,048	
Standar deviasi (standard deviation)		8,619		11,364	
Nilai t-hitung (4 Kompetensi) t-valued( 4 competencies)		9,5082			
Nilai t-hitung (Pedagogik) t-valued (pedagogic competence)		1,6980			
Rataan kinerja (average)		20,911		20,381	
Nilai t-hitung (Profesional) t-valued (professional competence)		1,1992			
Rataan kinerja (average)		5,000		4,690	
Nilai t-tabel (t-table)		1,9800			

Also, there is no difference in working performance between certified and uncertified teachers. Table 3 shows that  $t_{\text{value}} (1,9702) < t_{\text{table}} (1,9800)$ . Certified teachers have yet to implement their professionalism, which cover: 1) the mastery of material, structure, concepts

and thought patterns of knowledge which support the subjects being taught; 2) the development of professionalism through reflective actions.

The respective indicators of the mastery of material, structure, concepts and thought patterns of knowledge which support the subjects being taught include: a) teachers do the mapping of standard competence for the subjects being taught, identify difficult subjects, do the planning and the implementation of learning, and estimate the time allocation, b) teachers include accurate and contemporary information; 3) teachers design material and do the planning and the implementation which carries accurate, contemporary, and helpful information for the students in understanding the concepts of teaching materials. In these components, teachers have not yet been capable in implementing their skills.

Certified teachers, especially those working in villages are still weak in their ability to improve their profession. This is because of the paucity in information, teachers' knowledge, and other supporting factors such as infrastructures in schools. Indicators used to develop professionalism through reflective acts by teachers include: a) teachers conduct a self-evaluation specifically and comprehensively, supported by examples from self-experiences; b) teachers have learning journals, records of collegial feedback or assessment results of learning process as evidence of depicting their performance; c) teachers use this depiction to improve the planning and implementation of further learning in the Sustainable Profession Development Program (PKB); d) teachers can apply their experiences obtained through the PKB in the planning, implementation, and learning assessment and its follow-up; e) teachers conduct research, improve innovative works, attend scientific forum, and actively involve in the PKB; and f) teachers can make use of TIK in communicating and implementing the PKB.

Table 3. The results of performance assessment of senior and junior high school teachers

No	Kategori (Category)	Sertifikasi (certified)		Nonsertifikasi (uncertified)	
		Frekuensi (frequency)	%	Frekuensi (frequency)	%
1	Amat Baik (Very good)	11	13,41	1	1,41
2	Baik (good)	61	74,39	20	28,17
3	Cukup (fair)	10	12,20	50	70,42
Jumlah (Total)		82	100,00	71	100,00
Rataan kinerja (average)		45,341		40,352	
Standar deviasi (standard deviation)		14,376		15,774	
Nilai t-hitung (4 Kompetensi) t-valued (four competences)		7,9138			
Nilai t-hitung (Pedagogik) t-valued (pedagogic competence)		1,2062			
Rataan kinerja (average)		21,585		21,155	
Nilai t-hitung (Profesional) t-valued (professional competences)		1,9702			
Rataan kinerja (average)		4,829		4,451	
Nilai t-tabel (t-table)		1,9800			

The shortcoming of certified teachers in terms of professional competence lies in their inability in improving it through scholarly writings and research. They have not yet been capable in producing scholarly writings, so the ability to develop their profession becomes

languished. Also certified teachers have not shown different performances from those uncertified.

The real difference between certified and uncertified teachers is obvious in the personal and social components. The indicators of the former are: 1). to act in accordance with the norms of religion, law, social and national cultures; 2) to show a mature individual who can be emulated by others; 3) to have a working ethos, high responsibility, and pride of being a teacher. The indicators of the latter include : 1) to behave inclusively, to act objectively as well as indiscriminatory, ; 2) to communicate with fellow teachers, other staff, parents, students, and societies. These two indicators demonstrate that certified teachers are more superior than the uncertified ones.

## 2. Motivation and Teachers' Working Performance

Related to teachers' performance, both certification and motivation have impacts on the improvement of teachers' monthly outcomes. Working motivation can be seen from personal and social competences. Statistical analysis through the Chi Square measurement revealed that working motivation greatly affects working performance. This applies to both certified and uncertified teachers.

By contrast, teaching experiences do not guarantee professionalism. They do not have impacts on teachers' working performance because of teachers' lacks of skills in preparing teaching materials (pedagogical competence). There seemed a tendency that teachers reused the available materials without modifying it and innovating the new ones. Teachers have so far focused on the use of textbooks, lacked in improving their skills and knowledge. Teachers are expected to develop "Tacit Knowledge", that is practical knowledge gained from observation and first-hand experiences. Those who develop and use this knowledge will improve their working performance in organizations (Ivancevich, John, M., 2006).

This study has shown that motivation has impacts on teachers working performance, which has been evident in the statistical analysis ( $C_{\text{value}} 16,98 > C_{\text{table}} 9,49$ ). This implies that teachers need not only intellectual ability, but also motivation in carrying out their duties. Thus, to boost working performance, teachers need to be motivated.

## Conclusion

1. Professional teachers are those who satisfy qualification requirements, have competences and are certified. The competences include: a) pedagogic; b) personal; c) social; and d) professional. They must also develop their profession through among others 1) the application of their skill in improving the quality of teaching and learning, and 2) the production of something which is beneficial for educational world.
2. Results of this study have also shown that there is difference in working performance between certified and uncertified teachers. From the four competences, 78, 38 % certified teachers belong to the category "very good", while only 41,38 % uncertified teachers belong to this category, which is evident in the statistical analysis( $t_{\text{value}} 2,6892 > t_{\text{table}} 1,9800$ ).
3. There is no significant difference in both pedagogic and professional competences between certified and uncertified teachers. This means that both certified and uncertified teachers' teaching method and preparation in teaching and learning process do not differ. The weaknesses of certified teachers can be seen from the lack of mastery of the following components: students' characteristics, theories and principles of learning, curriculum development, learning activities, and the development of learners' potentials.
4. There is no difference in terms of professionalism (working performance) between certified and uncertified teachers. The statistical analysis showed that  $t_{\text{value}}$



(1,9702) <  $t_{table}(1,9800)$ . The criteria used for the assessment of professionalism include: 1) the mastery of teaching materials, structures, concepts and the thinking pattern of knowledge which supports the subjects being taught; 2) the development of professionalism through reflective acts.

5. The weaknesses of certified teachers in terms of the development of professionalism (through reflective acts) include the lack of the following points: a) teachers conduct a self-evaluation specifically and comprehensively, supported by examples from self-experiences; b) teachers have learning journals, records of collegial feedback or assessment results of learning process as evidence of depicting their performance; c) teachers use this depiction to improve the planning and implementation of further learning in the Sustainable Profession Development Program (PKB); d) teachers can apply their experiences obtained through the PKB in the planning, implementation, and learning assessment and its follow-up; e) teachers conduct research, improve innovative works, attend scientific forum, and actively involve in the PKB; and f) teachers can make use of TIK in communicating and implementing the PKB.

## Acknowledgment

This research was funded by the DIPA Faculty of Education Riau University. In particular we would like to express our gratitude to the Dean of the Faculty of Education Riau University who provided us with the fund.

## References

- Almasdi Syahza., 2009, *Metodologi Penelitian*, Pekanbaru: Pusbangdik Universitas Riau.
- Anwar Prabu Mangkunegara. A.A., 2005, *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan*, Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Eko Putro Widoyoko, 2010. *Analisis Pengaruh kinerja Guru Terhadap Motivasi Belajar Siswa*. (on-line). <http://www.um-pmr.ac.id/web/download/publikai-ilmiah/>, diakses 15 maret 2012.
- Hamzah B. Uno., 2008, *Teori Motivasi Dan Pengukurannya*, Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
- Kompasiana, 2011, Pengembangan Keprofesian Berkelanjutan (PKB): Peluang Peningkatan Karir Guru, <http://edukasi.kompasiana.com/2011/10/24/>, diakses 15 Januari 2013.
- Keke T. Aritonang, 2005, *Kompensasi Kerja Guru dan Kinerja Guru SMP Kristen BPK Penaburan Jakarta*. (on-line). [http://www.pbkpenabur.or.id/file/hal\\_01-16\\_kinerja\\_guru.pdf](http://www.pbkpenabur.or.id/file/hal_01-16_kinerja_guru.pdf). Diakses 14 maret 2012.
- Mukhlisin, 2009, *Professional Kinerja Guru Masa Depan*. (on-line). <http://mukhiliscaniago.wordpress.com/2009/10/26/profesional-kinerja-guru-menyongsong-masa-depan-presented-by-mukhlisin>. Diakses 17 maret 2012.
- Musarofah., 2008, *Kinerja Guru*, <http://idb4.wikispaces.com/file/view/fz4015-Kinerja+Guru.Pdf>, diakses tanggal 3 November 2012.
- Melayu S.P Hasibuan., 2008, *Organisasi dan Motivasi*, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Payaman J. Simanjuntak., 2005, *Manajemen dan Evaluasi Kerja*, Jakarta: LPFE-UI.
- Uhar Suharsaputra, 2012, *Pengembangan Kinerja Guru*, <http://uharsputra.wordpress.com/pendidikan/>, diakses 15 Desember 2012